# PLANNING APPLICATIONS COMMITTEE 18 July 2019

**APPLICATION NO.** 19/P0375 **DATE VALID** 15/01/2019

Address/Site Willington School, 18 Worcester Road, Wimbledon,

SW19 7QQ

Ward Hillside

**Proposal:** Removal of existing boundary fence, replacement

with new boundary brick wall/gate, new playground timber fence/gate and erection of a single storey detached building within playground area (between

new wall & fence).

**Drawing Nos** P1.04 Rev B, E1.31 Rev D and un-numbered plan (Rev 00)

Contact Officer: Stuart Adams (0208 545 3147)

## RECOMMENDATION

**GRANT Planning Permission subject to conditions.** 

#### CHECKLIST INFORMATION.

- Heads of agreement: N/A
- Is a screening opinion required: No
- Is an Environmental Statement required: No
- Has an Environmental Impact Assessment been submitted No
- Press notice No
- Site notice Yes
- Design Review Panel consulted No
- Number of neighbours consulted 26
- External consultations No.
- Number of jobs created N/A
- PTAL score 6a
- CPZ W2

#### 1. **INTRODUCTION**

1.1 The application has been brought before the Planning Applications Committee for consideration given the number of objections received.

## 2. SITE AND SURROUNDINGS

- 2.1 The application site comprises a part three, part two storey building, known as Willington School, which is located in Worcester Road, Wimbledon.
- 2.2 The area surrounding the application site is predominately residential in nature with a mixture of building styles and plot sizes.
- 2.3 To the rear of the application site the dwellings in Parkwood Road comprise pairs of semi detached dwellings.
- 2.4 To the north of the application site, the recently built terrace houses in Worcester Road comprise three storey town houses.
- 2.5 To the south of the application site is a small terrace comprising two storey flat roof houses.
- 2.6 The application site is not located within a Conservation Area.

## 3. **CURRENT PROPOSAL**

- 3.1 Removal of existing boundary fence, replacement with new boundary brick wall/gate, new playground timber fence/gate and erection of a single storey detached building within playground area (between new wall & fence).
- 3.2 The outbuilding would be a single storey flat roof building used as a kitchen, so that hot meals can be prepared onsite for the schoolchildren. The hot food would then be transferred to the main building during meal times. Permission for the outbuilding is for a temporary period of three years.
- 3.3 The proposed front boundary wall has been designed to match the existing front boundary wall. A 0.9m high timber fence would be added on the inside edge of the proposed wall in order to screen view of the outbuilding from the street scene. The timber fence attached to the wall is however a temporary measure that would need to be removed at the same time as the removal of the outbuilding (3 years).
- 3.4 The new 2.9m high timber fence/gates will be added to the playground, in front of the proposed outbuilding. The existing playground netting would be relocated behind the proposed timber fence. Both the new fencing and netting would however be for a temporary period of 3 years, these will be removed at the same time as the removal of the outbuilding. The land would then be reinstated to its former condition.

## 4. **PLANNING HISTORY**

- 4.1 15/P2994 Removal of fire escape gantries and replacement of fire doors with brick & obscure glazed windows Grant 17/09/2015
- 4.2 13/P3217 Erection of ground, first and second floor extension including refurbishment of existing fire escape and erection of a second floor rear extension at roof level Grant 26/11/2013.
- 4.3 08/P2063 Erection of a 3m x 6m shelter with a monopitched bronze polycarbonate roof. Maximum height of shelter will be 2.75m Grant 24/09/2008.
- 4.4 08/P2033 Improvements to playground including the addition of climbing equipment, external storage, picnic tables, seating and 32msq of coloured safety surfacing Grant 01/10/2008
- 4.5 06/P1838 Erection of extensions to existing school building to provide additional classrooms including a three storey side extension to the main frontage, a first floor side extension with under croft, two mansard roof extensions at second floor level on rear part of building, and addition of screen to existing rear escape passageway at first floor level Grant 19/12/2006
- 4.6 98/P0638 Planning permission was granted consent on 29/7/98 under delegated powers for the following - Retention of temporary classroom and toilet blocks
- 4.7 93/P0005 Planning permission was granted consent by the councils planning application committee on 22/4/93 for erection of a two storey side extension to provide classrooms and toilet facilities involving demolition of existing single story classroom and toilet facilities on south east side of building.
- 4.8 92/P0252 Planning permission was granted consent under delegated powers on 5/6/92 for the erection of a single storey building in the north corner of the site to provide a new workshop and toilet for school use.
- 4.9 90/P0805 Planning permission was granted consent subject to S106 agreement under delegated powers on the 19/9/90 for the redevelopment of site by the erection of a part three, part two, part single-storey office building with basement car parking involving demolition of all existing buildings on site.
- 4.10 90/P0122 Planning permission was refused by planning applications committee on 27/6/90 for the redevelopment of site by the erection of a part three, part two storey office building with basement car parking

involving demolition of existing buildings. The application was refused for the following reason –

'The proposed office building by reason of its size and massing would constitute an over development of this site, which is situated within a predominantly residential area, to the detriment of the amenities of neighbouring residential properties'.

4.11 88/P1436 - Planning permission was granted consent by the planning applications committee on 19/1/89 for the formation of a car parking area at the side of existing building to accommodate four cars with access off Worcester road.

## 5. **CONSULTATION**

- 5.1 The application has been advertised by site notice and letters of notification to the occupiers of neighbouring properties.
- 5.1.1 In response to the consultation, 12 letters of objection received (including one from the Wimbledon E Hillside Residents Association and the Wimbledon Society). The letters raise the following points:

## **Neighbour Impact**

- Noise from playground is consistent as children are always outside. The impact of the reduced sized playground would mean the boys are squashed into an even smaller surface area, which would mean that the children would be forced to play in a confined area, close to gardens and other residential houses.
- Loss of privacy
- Loss of sunlight
- The nearest residents will have to suffer from food smells and noise from an extractor fan. The extractor should be tunneled at the side of the school onto the roof where the smells are likely to be diluted and blown further afield from the immediate neighbours to the side and rear
- Smell and vermin from bins
- Disruption during construction
- Is the further reduction of the play/sports area not a breach of environmental regulations?
- What about the extractor fans polluting the environment designated as a play/sports facility?
- What provision is there for food waste collection? Noted that the bins are planned to be located outside the building. Food waste has the potential to attract vermin and become a health hazard in the middle of a residential area?

#### Other

- Why are Willington asking for planning permission for a kitchen again when a previous plan for a permanent kitchen in the basement was approved has been allowed to lapse?
- The site is too densely developed
- The application mentions that the kitchen would be used on Saturday mornings. Condition of the previous application is that the school ground and outside spaces are not to be used outside of normal school hours.

#### Use

- Opening hours include 9.00 17.00 weekdays, which is excessive when lunches will be over by midday.
- The building is more likely to be used as a classroom

#### Lack of Information

- There is no mention in the plans about the length of time the structure is expected to temporary and what intensions there are for a permanent solution?
- The operating hours also include use of the facility on Saturday 8.00 to 13.00. As the school is not open on a Saturday this raises questions over the intensions for this new facility?
- The application states that this building is temporary but the application contains no dates.
- There is no mention of what the intended use is on Saturday?
- No detail of kitchen layout and how it would be used?
- Lack of detail relating to extraction. A vent is shown on only one elevation.
  This suggests there will be no mechanical extraction removing noxious smell to high levels.
- There is no detail of where the children will eat their lunches?
- The application contains no details of a risk assessment on the use of the remainder of the playground for lessons and playtime?

#### Design

- Over development of the school
- The 3m high brick wall is too high and out of keeping
- No problem with the wall, the higher the better to help mask the sound from the schoolyard.
- Temporary kitchen will become permanent

#### <u>Highways</u>

- The application will increase traffic volume and frequency with the delivery of food supplies and waste removal.
- The application makes no attempt to manage the timing of deliveries.
- 5.1.2 Following re-consultation with neighbours, due to changes to the front boundary wall/gate and additional information being provided, 7 letters of

objection received. The letters raise the following points:

#### **Playground**

- Significant loss of playspace. There are over 200 boys in the school. The school has attempted to deflect these concerns with spurious reference to the junior playground, use of off-site locations for games and some unknown calculation for additional space. It is not practicable to take boys off site for activities.
- The school already accepts the playground is too small as the children use the playground on a rota system.
- A risk assessment should be carried out before any further reduction is approved to the playground size.
- The children will be squashed into an even smaller surface area (increased noise and disturbance).
- Playground to be reduced by 15% (not 3% as stated).
- This playground is used very early in the morning for children arriving at school, during the day for a variety of outdoor lessons and at the end of the day. This is the only playground used for football, running, ball games etc.
- High density and overdevelopment of the site. National Planning Policy Framework specifically highlights the requirement and consideration of health and well-being and that open space/recreational ground should not be built upon.

## Neighbour Amenity

- Limited extraction for fumes from the kitchen has been proposed but no stack to disperse odours at high level.
- Use of kitchen outside term times
- Smell and fumes from the kitchen. There is no professional evaluation.
- The application states that the nearest residence is 11m away, which we refute.
- Further statements are made regarding noise emittance from extractor fans but without more detailed information this cannot be tested, clarified or verified and also there cannot be relied upon.
- As there are residents parking immediately facing the new double gates and no dropped kerb, it is assumed that any delivery and the large refuse bins would be trolleyed along the pavement. The relocation of the bins will cause additional disturbance to neighbours both when refuse is placed in the bins as well as on collection.

#### **Highways**

- 3 times a day additional traffic
- Additional pollution levels

#### Other

- There is no proposal contained within the document detailing any alternative method if the proposal for installing a permanent kitchen fails.
- No dates given for temporary kitchen. If the provision of a permanent kitchen in the basement is crucial, then why did the school allow the approval to lapse? No renewal of permission has been submitted for the permanent kitchen. It is far from clear that the re-development of the basement kitchen would be completed during the 3 year period.
- Noise from squeaking wheels or the noisy sounds of trolleys being pushed across the hard surface.
- A three year temporary consent is too long as a standalone consent.
- Environmental Health should be consulted
- Hours of use should be conditioned.
- Are the new access gates to be used permanently for all school deliveries as well as all refuse collections?
- No side elevation showing the southern boundary fence, it is not known if the bins will be visible above that boundary?
- How tall is the temporary wall that will separate the kitchen from the playground?
- 5.2 <u>Environmental Health</u> No objection subject to conditions

## 6. **POLICY CONTEXT**

- 6.1 The relevant policies in the Council's adopted Site and Policies Plan (July 2014) are:
  - DM D2 Design Considerations in all developments
  - DM D3 Alterations and extensions to existing buildings
  - DM C2 Education for children and young people
  - DM EP2 Reducing and mitigating noise
  - DM T1 Support for sustainable transport and active travel
  - DM T2 Transport impacts of development
  - DM T3 Car parking and servicing standards
- 6.2 The relevant policies within the Adopted Core Strategy (July 2011) are:
  - CS14 Design
  - CS18 Active Transport
  - CS19 Public Transport
  - CS20 Parking, Servicing and Delivery
- 6.3 London Plan (2016):
  - 3.6 (Children and young people's play and informal; recreational facilities)
  - 7.3 (Designing Out Crime)
  - 7.4 (Local Character)

7.5 (Public Realm)

7.6 (Architecture)

7.15 (Reducing and managing noise, improving and enhancing the acoustic environment and promoting appropriate soundscapes)

#### 6.4 Other

- National Planning Policy Framework 2019
- National Planning Practice Guidance 2014
- Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004
- Draft London Plan 2017
- Draft Local Plan 2020

## 7. PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS

7.1 The principal planning considerations related to this application are the principle of development, design/visual impact, neighbour impact and highways.

## 7.2 Principle of development

- 7.2.1 Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 states that when determining a planning application, regard is to be had to the development plan, and the determination shall be made in accordance with the development plan, unless material considerations indicate otherwise.
- 7.2.2 Planning Policy DM C2 (Education for children and young people) of Merton's Site and Policies Plan seeks to ensure that there are sufficient school places of a suitable modem standard to meet statutory requirements. The proposed kitchen seeks to offer pupils the ability of having hot school dinners onsite. Providing improved facilities for school children is considered to be inline with the principles of planning policy DM C2 (Education for children and young people).

#### 7.3 **Design**

7.3.1 The overarching principle of national and local planning policy is to promote high quality design. Planning policy DM D2 (Design considerations in all development) of Merton's Sites and Policies Plan states that amongst other considerations, that proposals will be expected to relate positively and appropriately to the siting, rhythm, scale, density, proportions, height, materials and massing of surrounding buildings and existing street patterns, historic context, urban layout and landscape features of the surrounding area.

Wall

7.3.2 Following objections and advice from officers, the applicant has reduced the height and design of the proposed front wall to match existing. The proposed wall is now considered acceptable, respecting the context of the site and not appearing overly large. The applicant has included a timber fence to the back of the wall, in order to help screen the proposed outbuilding. The timber fence would increase the height of the wall, but as this is a temporary measure to screen the proposed outbuilding, there is no objection. The timber fence would however need to be removed in coordination with the removal of the outbuilding (3 year temporary period). The proposals would also result in the existing ball netting being set back further into the playground area, this would be an improvement as the netting is not an overly pleasant feature within the street scene.

#### Outbuilding (kitchen)

7.3.3 The proposed outbuilding is a modest single storey flat roof building that would be partly screened from view by the proposed front boundary wall and new playground fence. The proposed building is not considered to have any architectural merit; however, such structures are common within school settings. In addition, the outbuilding is only for a temporary period of time (3 years). Therefore, it is considered that the building would respect the visual amenities of the area and the context of the site for its intended purpose.

## 7.4 Playground

- 7.4.1 A number of objections from local residents have raised concerns that the proposal would result in the loss of playground space. Whilst the proposal would result in a small reduction in the amount of playground space, it has to be noted that the proposed outbuilding is for a temporary period of 3 years, whilst a permanent solution is found. A planning condition requiring the land to revert to its former condition (notwithstanding the proposed front boundary wall and gate) can be imposed on the planning permission.
- 7.4.2 Neighbours have raised a concern that the building will be permanent. As outlined above, the outbuilding is for a 3 year temporary nature. Failure to comply with the 3 year time period condition would result in a breach of planning condition and enforcement action being taken. If the school wants to extend the time period of the building or make it a permanent feature than a further planning application would be required. A new application would then be assessed on planning grounds at the time of submission.
- 7.4.3 Neighbours have also raised concern that the reduced amount of playground will result in increased levels of noise and disturbance. Whilst there would be a reduction, the reduction is limited to an existing playground where the school would still operate a rota system to control its usage. There is no evidence that the proposal would result in increased

noise and disturbance to justify refusal of planning permission.

#### 7.5 **Neighbour Impact**

- 7.5.1 The Councils Environmental Health Officer has confirmed that the kitchen and extract system to be installed is acceptable and matters relating to noise can be controlled via a suitable planning condition to ensure that there is no undue impact upon neighbours.
- 7.5.2 The applicant has confirmed that the kitchen would only be in operation for school lunches Monday to Friday (08.00 15.00), term time only. A planning condition controlling hours of use (as above) can be imposed on any planning permission.

#### 16 Worcester Road

- 7.5.3 This neighbour is located to the southeast of the application site. A small access way separates the application site from this neighbouring property. The flank wall of this neighbouring property is located approximately 3.5m from the side boundary of the application site. The proposed outbuilding is a modest sized single storey flat roof building set behind existing and proposed boundary treatment. The existing/proposed screening would therefore help partly screen views of the outbuilding from this neighbouring property. In addition, the level of separation between the proposed outbuilding and this neighbour would ensure that there would be no undue loss of amenity.
- 7.5.4 The proposal would also result in bins being stored onsite, adjacent to the proposed outbuilding. The proposed bins would sit behind the existing side boundary fence (approx. 1.8m high), the school are in the process of arranging for daily collection of food waste and the bins would be located approximately 7m from the neighbours frontage. It is therefore considered that there would be no undue loss of amenity.

#### 65 Compton Road & 37 A Alwyne Road

7.5.5 These neighbours are located on the opposite side of Worcester Road. Therefore, there is a good level of separation between the two neighbours. The proposed boundary wall/gate has been lowered in height and designed to match the existing boundary wall. The proposed kitchen would sit behind the proposed front wall (with timber above) and would be well distanced away from these neighbours to ensure that there would be no undue loss of amenity.

#### Parkwood Road

7.5.6 Neighbouring properties in Parkwood Road that sit to the rear of the application site are well distanced away from the proposed development to ensure that there would be no undue loss of amenity.

## 7.6 Parking and Traffic

- 7.6.1 The applicant has confirmed that there would be 10 deliveries per week and daily collection of food waste. In order to limit impact on the highway network, the applicant has stated that all deliveries will be scheduled to be outside of the busy periods for the children's drop off and collection (8.00 9.00 and 15.00 to 16.30). This can be controlled via a suitable planning condition.
- 7.6.2 Given the modest size of the proposed kitchen and the predicated 10 deliveries per week, plus daily food waste collection, the development is not considered to have an adverse impact upon the highway network to warrant refusal of planning permission.

## 8. <u>SUSTAINABILITY AND ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT REQUIREMENTS</u>

- 8.1.1 The proposal is for minor development and an Environmental Impact Assessment is not required in this instance.
- 8.1.2 The application does not constitute Schedule 1 or Schedule 2 development. Accordingly, there are no requirements in terms on EIA submission.

### 9. **CONCLUSION**

9.1.1 The proposed development outbuilding and boundary treatment are considered to respect the context of the school site and will help the school deliver hot school meals on a temporary basis whilst a more permanent solution is delivered. The proposal is considered to respect the visual amenities of the area and would have no undue impact upon neighbours or highway conditions. The proposal is in accordance with Adopted Sites and Policies Plan, Core Planning Strategy and London Plan policies. The proposal is therefore recommended for approval subject to conditions.

#### RECOMMENDATION

#### **GRANT PLANNING PERMISSION**

Subject to the following conditions:

- 1. A1 Commencement of Development (full application)
- 2. A7 <u>Approved Plans</u>
- 3. B3 The facing materials to be used for the development hereby

permitted shall be those specified in the application form unless (including matching brick wall) otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

- 4. C08 No use of flat roof
- 5. D01 The use hereby permitted shall only operate during school term times between the hours of 08.00 to 15.00 Monday to Friday.
- 6. All deliveries, loading, unloading or other servicing activities shall not take place between the hours of 08.00 09.00 and 15.00 to 16.30 Monday to Friday.
- 7. The proposed outbuilding (kitchen) and timber fence (attached to front boundary wall) is for a temporary period of 3 years and the use hereby permitted shall cease and the land restored to its former condition (notwithstanding the proposed front boundary wall/gates) on or before (inset date).
- 8. The outbuilding shall only be used as a kitchen for the school and for no other purpose (classroom for example), (including any other purpose within Class D1 of the Schedule to the Town and Country Planning (Use Classes Order) 1987), or in any provision equivalent to that Class in any statutory instrument revoking and re-enacting that Order with or without modification.
- 9. Noise levels, (expressed as the equivalent continuous sound level) LAeq (10 minutes), from the new plant/machinery associated with the new ductwork installation shall not exceed LA90-10dB at the boundary with the closest residential property.
- 10. The kitchen ventilation and extract system shall be installed in accordance with the approved plans and specifications before the use commences and shall be permanently retained as such thereafter. Servicing of the system shall be undertaken in line with the manufacturer's specification.
- 11. The development hereby approved shall not be occupied until the refuse and recycling storage facilities shown on the approved plans have been fully implemented and made available for use. These facilities shall thereafter be retained for use at all times and no refuse shall be left overnight in the street.
- 12. The gates hereby approved shall not open over the adjacent highway

Click here for full plans and documents related to this application.